# REPORTER

No 6418 Wednesday 9 March 2016 Vol cxlvi No 23

#### **CONTENTS**

Notices		Graces	
Calendar	415	Graces submitted to the Regent House on	
Discussion on 15 March 2016: Cancellation	415	9 March 2016	416
Election to the Nominating Committee for External Members of the Council	415	End of the Official Part of the 'Reporter'	
Election to the Board of Scrutiny	415	Report of Discussion	
Student statistics, 2015–16	415	Tuesday, 1 March 2016	417
Vacancies, appointments, etc. Vacancies in the University	415	College Notices Vacancies	418
Events, courses, etc.		Awards	418
Announcement of lectures, seminars, etc.	416	Societies, etc.	
Notices by the General Board Amendment to the composition of the Faculty Board of Music	416	Cambridge Society for the Application of Research	418
		Cambridge Philosophical Society	418
		External Notices	416
		University of Oxford	418



#### NOTICES

#### Calendar

- 11 March, Friday. Full Term ends.
- 19 March, Saturday. Congregation of the Regent House at 11 a.m.
- 23 March, Wednesday. Last ordinary issue of the Reporter in Lent Term.
- 24 March, Thursday. Lent Term ends.
- 27 March, Sunday. Easter Day. Scarlet Day.
- 2 April, Saturday. Congregation of the Regent House at 11 a.m.

# Discussion on Tuesday, 15 March 2016: Cancellation

The Vice-Chancellor gives notice that the Discussion announced for Tuesday, 15 March 2016 will not take place as there are no Reports ready for discussion.

# **Election to the Nominating Committee for External Members of the Council**

4 March 2016

The Vice-Chancellor announces that he has received the following nomination for election to the Nominating Committee for External Members of the Council in class (*d*) (a member of the Senate elected by the Regent House), and that it has been certified to him that the candidate has consented to be so nominated:

Professor Dame CAROL BLACK, N, nominated by Professor S. E. Owens, N, and Ms J. Raine, N.

No other candidates having been nominated, the Vice-Chancellor declares that Professor Black is elected to the Nominating Committee in class (d) for four years from 1 October 2015.

# **Election to the Board of Scrutiny**

4 March 2016

The Vice-Chancellor announces that he has received the following nomination for election to the Board of Scrutiny in class (c)(ii) (a member of the Regent House), and that it has been certified to him that the candidate has consented to be so nominated:

Dr Elspeth Mair Morfoot, nominated by Professor Sir Michael Gregory, CHU, and Professor C. A. I. French.

No other candidates having been nominated, the Vice-Chancellor declares that Dr Morfoot is elected to the Board in class (c)(ii) with immediate effect until 30 September 2019.

#### Student statistics, 2015–16

The student statistics publication for 2015–16 is now available on the Student Statistics Office website at http://www.admin.cam.ac.uk/offices/planning/sso/studentnumbers/index.html.

## VACANCIES, APPOINTMENTS, ETC.

# Vacancies in the University

A full list of current vacancies can be found at http://www.jobs.cam.ac.uk/.

Academic Clinical Lecturers in the School of Clinical Medicine (fixed-term); seven posts available in the following specialties: Endocrinology and Diabetes Mellitus or General (Internal) Medicine or Rheumatology, General Practice, General (Adult) Psychiatry, General Surgery, Neurology or Neurosurgery, Intensive Care Medicine, and Old Age Psychiatry; tenure: four years; salary: £31,301–£54,199; closing date: 1 April 2016; further particulars: http://www.jobs.cam.ac.uk/job/9621/; quote reference: RC08458

Client Engagement and Information Services Manager in the Careers Service; salary: £38,896–£49,230; closing date: 4 April 2016; further particulars: http://www.jobs.cam.ac.uk/job/9684/; quote reference: DD08513

The University values diversity and is committed to equality of opportunity.

The University has a responsibility to ensure that all employees are eligible to live and work in the UK.

#### EVENTS, COURSES, ETC.

## Announcement of lectures, seminars, etc.

The University offers a large number of lectures, seminars, and other events, many of which are free of charge, to members of the University and others who are interested. Details can be found on individual Faculty, Department, and institution websites, on the What's On website (http://www.admin.cam.ac.uk/whatson/) and on Talks.cam (http://www.talks.cam.ac.uk/).

Brief details of upcoming events are given below.

African Archaeology Group The John Alexander Seminar Series 2015–16:

> Let's go wild: how North African communities resisted new farming practices, by Dr Giulio Lucarini, on 11 March 2016 at 4 p.m. in the

South Lecture Room, Division of Archaeology

Equality and Diversity Annual WiSETI lecture: Do you have to be a

genius to be an astrophysicist?, by Professor Meg Urry, on 17 March 2016 at 5.30 p.m. in The Wolfson Hall, Churchill College

http://www.mcdonald.cam.ac.uk/ events/african-seminars

http://wisetiannual.eventbrite.co.uk

# NOTICES BY THE GENERAL BOARD

# Amendment to the composition of the Faculty Board of Music

9 March 2016

#### With immediate effect

The General Board, on the recommendation of the Faculty Board of Music, has approved the following amendment to the membership of the Faculty Board.

By amending the entry for the Faculty Board of Music in Schedule I to the regulations for Classes of Faculty Board Membership, Elections, and Periods of Office (Statutes and Ordinances, p. 573) so that the number of members in class (f) (members elected by and from among the students in the Faculty) increases by one to four.

#### **GRACES**

# Graces submitted to the Regent House on 9 March 2016

The Council submits the following Graces to the Regent House. These Graces, unless they are withdrawn or a ballot is requested in accordance with the regulations for Graces of the Regent House (Statutes and Ordinances, p. 107), will be deemed to have been approved at 4 p.m. on Friday, 18 March 2016.

- 1. That the recommendations in paragraph 3 of the Report of the General Board, dated 10 February 2016, on the establishment of an Al-Kindi Professorship (*Reporter*, 6415, 2015–16, p. 394) be approved.
- 2. That, on the nomination of the Council, Professor David Feldman, DOW, be reappointed Assessor to the Visitor of Clare College until the division of the Lent Term on 13 February 2019.
- 3. That, on the nomination of the Council, Professor Eilís Veronica Ferran, CTH, be reappointed Assessor to the Visitor of Clare College until the division of the Lent Term on 13 February 2019.
- **4.** That Regulation 1(c) of the regulations for the Societies Syndicate (Statutes and Ordinances, p. 132) be rescinded, existing Regulation 1(d) amended so as to read as follows, and the remaining paragraphs renumbered:
  - (c) three members of the Regent House appointed by the Council, one of whom shall be a Bursar and one a Senior Tutor;

J. W. NICHOLLS, Registrary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> These changes, proposed by the Council on the recommendation of the Societies Syndicate, amend the membership of the Syndicate so as to remove a reference to an ex officio member of a body that no longer exists, replacing it with an additional member of the Regent House appointed by the Council.

#### REPORT OF DISCUSSION

# Tuesday, 1 March 2016

A Discussion was held in the Senate-House. Pro-Vice-Chancellor Professor Graham Virgo was presiding, with the Registrary's Deputy, the Junior Proctor, the Deputy Senior Proctor, and two other persons present.

The following Reports were discussed:

Report of the Council, dated 9 February 2016, on the arrangements for approving market pay (Reporter, 6414, 2015–16, p. 356)

# Dr S. J. Cowley (Faculty of Mathematics):

Deputy Vice-Chancellor, this Report only indirectly references the Second Joint Report of 25 July 2005 of the Council and the General Board on a new pay and grading structure for non-clinical staff. One of the aims of that report was to implement pay and grading structures that would 'stand up to challenge on equal pay grounds'. Means of achieving this included the introduction of the single pay spine and the use of a grading methodology. One of the features of the proposals 'was greater transparency about criteria, processes, and outcomes in relation to pay and grading'. The current Report seems to have been inspired by hand-brake turns.

As recorded in the Equal Pay Review, 2014 (*Reporter*, 2014–15, 6370, p. 300), 'the average payment in 2014 for market supplements, market pay, and advanced contribution supplements equates to £15,855 for male and £9,374 for female employees' (although this discrepancy had somewhat reduced since 2012). A number of us warned, when market pay was introduced, that such payments tend to be awarded disproportionately to men; we were right. What is the point of having a single pay spine and making use of a grading methodology if all that happens is that loopholes are exploited? By the secretive nature of such payments, how do they introduce greater transparency about criteria, processes, and outcomes? Market pay drives a coach and horses through many of the high-minded ambitions of the 2005 Report.

Indeed, all posts have to be graded using the somewhat notorious PD33, so all have a stipend. However, increasingly adverts for upper-end posts do not refer to that stipend; is this because there is a presumption that market pay is to become relatively standard at the top end? No wonder the central bodies want to increase *fivefold* the threshold for requiring committee approval for an award of market pay to 50% or £50k (whichever is the smaller) of basic pay. Committees provide essential checks and balances.

Pay is an emotive subject, and while I was on the Council, I heard good reasons why certain staff had to be paid a market supplement, e.g. staff in the Investment Office. I also heard bad reasons. When appointing a Vice-Chancellor, an external member opined that the remuneration of Cambridge's VC should surely be in the top quartile of similar UK VCs; fortunately, the reply from a bunch of academics was a resounding 'no'.

As was noted concerning the Avery benefaction, it is not lawful for a charity to overpay its staff. It should pay the amount that is reasonably necessary to secure an individual's capabilities and commitment. As a lawyer put it somewhat crudely, 'if an individual was happy to accept the Professorship for an annual remuneration of £100,000, why would a charity offer remuneration of £200,000? This principle is pervasive in charity law, and is the reason why charities generally are not allowed to make *ex gratia* payments'. In the case of the VC, I proposed that we shot low, e.g. at the paltry level of the Prime

Minister's salary, or that of a low responsibility job like the Head of the Metropolitan Police, rather than to match Oxford. For once (possibly the only time) I was somewhat humoured. Before final interviews, remuneration was settled with the candidates if they proved to be successful. All accepted far closer to my proposed level than that opined by the external. Why? Well, settling remuneration before a decision keeps the employer/charity in the driving seat, and of course negates the weasel words in the Report that 'where it is necessary to agree market pay for recruitment or retention purposes, immediate action is usually required and further committee approval militates against timely action'. Indeed, words fail me regarding that statement (actually, they didn't, but I am not sure that the Reporter would be willing to print what I thought). Has the Old Schools never heard of email? Is it impossible to circulate for a decision?

Yes, market pay is sometimes necessary. Yes, sometimes a decision has to be made quickly. So how to proceed? First, more opportunity should be made to negotiate remuneration with the final candidates before interview and decision. Second, if significant market pay is subsequently required, then papers should be circulated electronically asking for approval within 48 hours (or if necessary, 24 hours). Since the endgame for many appointments, especially academics, seems to go on interminably, there is time to get committee approval. The lack of time argument is a fig leaf.

The Report also contains the statement, as regards the statistical information published annually about staff grades, The format of the data provided on market pay awards will be reviewed before the Notice concerning data as at 31 July 2016 is published'. No explanation is given as to why the format needs to change. Do the Council wish to make it more obscure or more transparent? My vote is more transparent. Indeed, why not go the whole hog and publish individual pay, or at least market supplements, e.g. in a band. In the past the central bodies have argued against publishing, even banded, individuals' salaries, appealing to the Data Protection Act. Hogwash. Her Majesty's Government does it for salaries over £150,000: see https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/ system/uploads/attachment data/file/62343/high-earnerspay 0.csv/preview.

Further, even today Cabinet Office Minister Matt Hancock has stated (according to the BBC):

We will spread transparency throughout public services, making sure all public bodies routinely publish details of senior pay and perks.

Having been on the Council, I am aware of at least some of the large market supplements (including bonuses) that have been, and are being, paid. The Regent House does not know. It does not know if any of those who oversaw an overspend of £50–£80m on North West Cambridge are being paid market pay, and whether it is more or less than 50%. Maybe they should, particularly if, as seems likely, no senior heads are going to roll. I do not believe that paying high salaries necessarily recruits the best staff. I do not care whether our salaries are in the top quartile of UK university salaries. Indeed, sometimes the most committed and capable staff will come for less. There are outstanding examples (although the shine is going off at least one in my eyes).

What I also find galling is that the money is there if it is for top salaries, or for animal houses, or for capital overruns (possibly overseen by staff with large amounts of market pay). The time it was not there was for USS. Then there was no money (when, in fact, we now know that the money was there, both here and at other universities, but for capital plans and market pay, rather than the rank and file). I predicted that those at the top would look after themselves; are they doing so? Your pension has been screwed, sir (and it is more often

than not a sir)? No matter, we will just give you a secret 49% market supplement, with few checks and balances.

When I staffed the UCU stand for new appointments, I used to say that the University was a good employer. No more. There have to be checks and balances on market pay. The grading methodology should be respected, and if it is not up to the job it should be reformed (and those in post who would benefit, should). We should take the commitment to equal pay seriously (or return the Athena SWAN Silver Award). The solution is not to reward a few women with even more market pay (which, cynic that I am, seems to be what is happening), but to reward all staff fairly and transparently. The University is losing its moral compass (as illustrated by a recent decision not to comply with an Employment Tribunal order).

At the end of the Report, the Council notes that the HR Committee is conducting a wide-ranging review of certain HR practices including pay and reward, for report to the Council later in 2015–16. If so, this Report should be placed on hold until then, and its revised recommendations (if any survive) should be included there.

Report of the General Board, dated 10 February 2016, on the establishment of an Al-Kindi Professorship (Reporter, 6415, 2015–16, p. 394).

No remarks were made on this Report.

#### **COLLEGE NOTICES**

#### **Vacancies**

Queens' College: Queens' Postdoctoral Research Associates (Q-PDRA) 2016 (four posts) for matriculated members of Queens' College; tenure: one year in the first instance; personal research allowance of £500 plus SCR membership and three meals per week; closing date: 29 April 2016; further details: http://www.queens.cam.ac. uk/life-at-queens/vacancies/queens-postdoctoral-research-associates-2016

Postdoctoral Research Associates (PDRA) 2016 (four posts); applicants should not be matriculated members of any other College; tenure: one year in the first instance; personal research allowance of £500 plus SCR membership and three meals per week; closing date: 29 April 2016; further details: http://www.queens.cam. ac.uk/life-at-queens/vacancies/postdoctoral-research-associates-2016

#### **Awards**

Magdalene College: The College invites submissions for its annual Peter Peckard Prize, worth £1,000, on a topic relating to some form of human exploitation and slavery today. Essays or contributions in other media are welcomed from all undergraduate members of the University.

The closing date for the receipt of entries is 1 July 2016. Further details are available at http://www.magd.cam.ac.uk/college-news/the-peter-peckard-prize-2016/.

#### SOCIETIES, ETC.

# Cambridge Society for the Application of Research

Dr Graham Farmelo, physicist, author, and historian (http://grahamfarmelo.com) will give a lecture entitled *Churchill's bomb*, at 7.30 p.m. on Monday, 14 March 2016, in the Wolfson Lecture Theatre, Churchill College, Storey's Way. Further details are available at http://www.csar.org.uk.

# **Cambridge Philosophical Society**

A one-day meeting on the *Evolution of life* will be held on Friday, 18 March 2016, from 9 a.m. to 5.45 p.m., in the Babbage Lecture Theatre, New Museums Site. Further details are available at http://www.cambridge philosophicalsociety.org.

#### EXTERNAL NOTICES

# **University of Oxford**

Department of Physiology, Anatomy, and Genetics: Associate Professorship of Cell Physiology (in association with a Tutorship and Official Fellowship in Pre-clinical Medicine at Lady Margaret Hall); salary: £45,066–£60,513, plus College housing allowance of £7,800; closing date: 30 March 2016 at 12 noon; further particulars: http://www.dpag.ox.ac.uk/vacancies/current-vacancies/associate-professorship-of-cell-physiology

Faculty of Oriental Studies: Ieoh Ming Pei Professorship of Islamic Art and Architecture; closing date: 11 April 2016; further details: http://www.ox.ac.uk/about\_the\_university/jobs/fp/

Wadham College: Fixed-term Fellowship in Law 2016–20; stipend: £27,328; closing date: 5 April 2016; further details: https://www.wadham.ox.ac.uk/about-wadham/jobs/academic/fellowship-in-law

Junior Research Fellowship in Economic History; stipend: £27,328; closing date: 7 April 2016; further details: https://www.wadham.ox.ac.uk/about-wadham/jobs/ academic/junior-research-fellowship-in-economic-history